

# Contract Award to Rite -Way Roof Corporation for the 2020 Roof Repairs to the City -Owned Facilities Project

Bill Hemsley  
Public Works



# Background

- Eastvale Fire Station #27 is located on 7067 Hamner Avenue
- Opened on September 21, 2011.
- Constructed by RIC Construction.
- Designed by STK Architecture.
- Funded by the Riverside County Economic Development Agency.
- Ten-year warranty for workmanship and materials.
- Requisition Detail Report of leaks was completed on November 3, 2016.
- The Riverside County Fire Department attempted to claim the roofing warranty provided by UMICO, but they had filed for bankruptcy on May 2, 2012, and their contractor's license (C39) had expired on April 30, 2013.
- Due to these combining factors, the fire department was unable to claim the warranty
- First repair to Tecta America for \$8,675.00 and warranty repairs was provided.
- The Garland Company completed a Roof Asset Management Report on January 23, 2018, that showed 13 leaks throughout the station.
- R&R Roofing completed the second repair for \$8,440.00 on February 28, 2018, and a one-time callback for the warranty was provided.
- In October 2018, the roof started to leak again on the area directly above the captain's office and the one-time callback warranty was claimed by The Fire Department.
- The roof is once again leaking excessively.

# Purpose



FS #27 Tarpred Roof



FS #27 Street View

## Fire Station 27:

- Systematic leaks over last 4-5 years due to poor construction.
- Warranty – Difficult to pursue due to bankruptcy
- Spending too much on repairs annually that come back in other locations.



## Alt Bid Tile Example

- Some contractors thought it may be same cost as R&R clay.
- Will get 25-year warranty
- 26 clay tiles were broken – may break again over time.

# Purpose



Altfillisch House Tarpred Roof

## Altfillisch:

- There is a leak near the chimney in the house.
- The garage roof is leaking since the property was purchased.



Altfillisch Garage Roof is leaking due to deteriorated torch down roof system

# Scope of Work

## Fire Station 27:

- R&R roof underlayment and any damaged roof deck and structural roof systems
- R&R existing clay roof tiles and installing new tiles as needed.
- Living space only – not truck bays which are not leaking.
  
- Alternative bid: Use new concrete tiles instead of R&R existing clay tiles over the entire fire station.

## Altfillisch property:

- Leak repair at the house, R&R existing clay roof tiles.
- Leak repair of the torch-down garage roof.
  
- Alternative bid: R&R the torch-down roofing system over the garage.

# Bid Results Summary:

NAME OF BIDDER	CITY	BID AMOUNT (Base + Alts)	Base Bid (FS#27)	Base Bid (Altfillisch)	ALT #1 (FS#27)	ALT #2 (Garage)
Rite-Way Roof Corporation	Fontana	\$347,923**	\$132,422	\$16,624	\$174,006	\$24,871
Tecta America	Santa Ana	\$461,896	\$119,820	\$31,750	\$269,676	\$40,650
ERC - Commercial Water Proofing	Santa Ana	\$495,426*	\$189,995	\$30,970	\$211,235	\$63,226
Best Contracting Services	Gardena	\$498,200	\$138,400	\$7,000	\$321,800	\$31,000

\* Note: This bid treated the alternate bids as additive bids. The amount shown above is the intended bid amount. They incorrectly wrote that their total bid (base bid plus alternate bid) was 299,950.00. The bidder admitted to the City that this was the case so their intended bid amount was \$495,426.00.

\*\* Note: The low bidder had a \$8,000 math error in their bid. Their bid proposal listed \$339,923.00 and the actual amount was \$347,923.00. The low bid is approximately \$114,000 less than the second low bid.

Rite-Way references good. In business for 27 years. Valid contractor's licenses.

# Options

- Option 1 (Base Bid Only):
  - FS#27: Remove & Replace (R&R) Living Space Roof – Keep Clay Tile
  - Altfillisch: Repair House and Garage Roofs
- Option 2:
  - FS# 27: Alt. Bid for new concrete tiles over whole station
  - Altfillisch: Base Bid – Repair House and Garage Roofs
- Option 3:
  - FS#27: Base Bid – R&R Living Space Roof – Keep Clay Tile – Repair
  - Altfillisch: Repair Altfillisch House Roof; Alt Bid: R&R Garage Roof
- Option 4:
  - FS# 27: Alt. Bid for new concrete tiles over whole station
  - Altfillisch: Repair Altfillisch House Roof; Alt Bid: R&R Garage Roof

# Fiscal Impact:

Option	Fire Fund	General Fund	Total Project Amount
1	\$145,665.00	\$18,286.00	\$163,951.00
2	\$191,407.00	\$18,286.00	\$209,693.00
3	\$145,665.00	\$40,340.00	\$186,005.00
4	\$191,407.00	\$40,340.00	\$231,747.00

Totals above include 10% contingency.

Fire Station 27:

- Alt Bid (concrete tile whole station) will cost \$45,742 more than the base bid.

Altfillisch

- Alt Bid (replace whole garage roof) will cost \$22,054 more than the base bid.

Overall: the more permanent repair will cost about \$67,000 more.

# Recommendations:

- Approve a contract with Rite-Way Roof Corporation, the lowest responsible bidder, in accordance with unit bid prices based on the option desired in the actions discussed below:
  - Option 1 (Base Bid): Award amount: \$149,046.00 plus 10 percent contingency in the amount of \$14,905.00 for a total award amount of \$163,951.00.
  - Option 2 (Fire Station Alternate Bid 1 & Altfillisch Base Bid): Award amount: \$190,630.00 plus 10 percent contingency in the amount of \$19,063.00 for a total award amount of \$209,693.00.
  - Option 3 (Fire Station Base Bid, Altfillisch Base Bid & Altfillisch Garage Alternative Bid 2): Award amount: \$169,095.00 plus 10 percent contingency in the amount of \$16,910.00 for a total award amount of \$186,005.00.
  - Option 4 (Fire Station Alternate Bid 1 & Altfillisch Base Bid & Altfillisch Alternative Bid 2): Award amount: \$210,679.00 plus 10 percent contingency in the amount of \$21,068.00 for a total award amount of \$231,747.00.

# Recommendations (Cont.):

- Waive the bid irregularity caused by a math error (in the amount of \$8,000) since it does not affect the low bid status.
- Approve a budget amendment:
  - Allocating General Funds to equal the award amount plus 10% contingency for the Altfillisch roof repairs depending on the options selected; and
  - Allocating Fire Funds to equal the award amount plus 10% contingency for Fire Station 27 Roof Repairs, depending on the options selected; and
- Authorize the City Manager to execute all necessary documents.

# Questions?